Painting’s Identity Problem:
A Coming of Age Story

Niina Cochran

Master’s MA Thesis
Aalto University
School of Art and Design
Visual Culture
Contents

Tell Me What it is About [Abstract]
Preparation [Introduction 1]
A Knock on the Door [Introduction 2]
The First Meeting [Untitled’s Background]
Next Week [For Inspiration]
The Following Week [Exploration of Materials]
Franz West and Process
Angela De La Cruz: [Installation, Object, Anthropomorphism and Color; Oh My!]
Another Week [The First Painting Steps]
Interview with Lee Bontecou and Donald Judd  [Not Painting, Nor Sculpture]
Lucy Lippard  [The Non-Movement]
Yves Klein [Anthropomorphism]
Form Follow Up
The Easels [What Do Painting’s Want?]  
Form Painting Follow Up
Who Are You?! [Empathy]
All Things Come to an End
Where Did You Get That?! [Bibliography]
Tell Me What it is About (Abstract)
Painting’s Identity Problem: A Coming of Age Story

Master’s Thesis (MA)

Niina Cochran

This thesis is a self-exploration to find my new artistic language and identity. To gain this new understanding I engage in a dialogue with my future Painting, Untitled. Untitled has come to me for help to find its identity and through writing and a physical piece of artwork, Untitled is born. We search together for our new identities and processes by looking at four other artists: Franz West, Angela De La Cruz, Lee Bontecou and Yves Klein. We try to understand our new language within three-dimensional Installational Painting by learning from art critics such as; Donald Judd and Lucy Lippard. At the end of our journey together it becomes more clear on what Untitled wants to say to the world and to help ground these ideas we look at W.J.T Mitchell, James Elkins and other’s. After Untitled’s birth I hope to better understand myself as an artist, how to work within Painting three-dimensionally and how this type of artwork has come to be in today’s world.

Keywords: Painting, Sculpture, Three-dimensional, Empathy, Identity
Preparation (Introduction 1)
You are about to read a non-traditional MA thesis. You have been for-warned. This paper is based on self-discovery and three-dimensional, Installational Painting. To be able to go through this process I create a dialogue, between me and my Painting, Untitled. Untitled is part autonomous and part of myself. We talk to one another to understand ideas and we talk to other artists and theorists to understand their ideas. Do you want to say something, Untitled?

Yes, thank you. Untitled here. I am a Painting, I am Niina’s future Painting. At the beginning of the text I represent the traditional two-dimensional Painting, that we all know. I come to Niina to help me create a new identity and to be born into a new, more contemporary and three-dimensional Installational body, as I am unhappy in my current one and Niina is unhappy with her current visual language and way of working, correct?

Correct.

We start our process by looking at four other artists work to gain understanding of our process, to develop Niina’s new language, and my new body. Once we start to get a hold of this, Niina starts asking me the tough questions. What do I want (to say)? For this we look into some theorists to help us base our ideas and get them across, (hopefully). You get to be witness to the whole transformation of myself. It is quite intimate really, as you watch the building of my body and hear my innermost thoughts and desires. Actually it’s a bit embarrassing….so feel free to walk away and go no further.

Oh Untitled, stop. We are both on the chopping block here, you are not alone, we will go down together. Anyway, that is the gist of what this text is about and what you are in for. I hope you understand and enjoy.
A Knock on the Door [Introduction]
I’m in my Painting studio staring at a wall thinking about my next project, a three-dimensional, Installational Painting, but how do I start? I’m startled by a knock on the door, it’s Untitled, I forgot it was coming today. Untitled had called me last week upset, mentioned something about having identity problems, needed a change in its life, I said I needed some change too; that this could be exactly what we both have been looking for. Untitled is waiting for me at the door looking worried and confused. It’s a large flat rectangular Painting, worn out with dents on its corners. It doesn’t look very happy, so I try to smile to let it know that things will be okay. I hadn’t fully done this type of work before, I had told Untitled last week on the phone, but I wanted to give it a try. That we could always look at other Artist’s experiences to help gain our process and understanding, that Untitled would also have to reveal to me, exactly what it wanted to say to the world, but I guess we would need to build up a repertoire first, to establish some trust, before it would feel comfortable telling me such things. I could tell it had been through a lot as we spoke, it isn’t easy being gazed at and judged for a living I suppose, especially when you don’t feel comfortable in your own skin, so to speak. I suggested we could also look at some art critics and their thoughts on this type of work, and others to help ground us on what Untitled wanted to say. It was apparent to us both that we had a long road ahead, but all possibilities of Untitled’s new three-dimensional identity and body were open to us. So I opened the door, Untitled walked in, and we began......
The First Meeting [Untitled’s Background]
So glad you could come. Please sit down.

**Thanks, is here fine?**

Yes, that is fine, anywhere you like..... So tell me more about why you are here.

**Well, it is like this you see. I’m having some identity problems. I am just not sure who I am anymore and I am feeling pressure from my family and from my past and it is clouding up my mind on who I am.**

I see and who did you use to be?

**Well, life used to be simple and I used to be able to be happy within this simplicity. I was rectangular, two-dimensional and hung on a wall, but it just isn’t enough for me anymore. It’s not who I am, I got a taste of how life could be and I can’t go back. I see others around me changing and I want to too, I just don’t know how. I just don’t feel comfortable in my body anymore and not all of my family is supportive of this change.**

Can you tell me more of this “taste” you had and how it affected you?

**Well there was this one time when I was hanging on a wall minding my own business and then all of a sudden I fell. The Technician didn’t hang me up well I guess. Anyway, that’s not the point. The point is that I felt the floor for the first time and while I was down there people were passing by me and giving me more attention than ever before. They would stand there and stare at me and sometimes they would have a discussion with the person they were with about my “meaning”. And I have to say...I liked it. It felt great to have that much attention. It isn’t easy competing with everyone else around you every day. Then there was this other time when I traveled to a new home and I was surrounded by new friends, they looked different than normal, some had objects stuck to them or their frame wasn’t rectangular. I felt all excited inside, kinda aroused, you know? They seemed so exotic and I wanted to get to know them. As luck had it, we got to travel around together for awhile and during that time I learned about others, ones that were three-dimensional, temporary, directly on the wall or took up a whole room. It was fantastic, the stories they told! I felt like I had been sheltered and missing out on my whole life and that is when I realized that I’m not who I thought I was. That I want to change, so I started to ask around, where could I get these changes safely done and that’s how I found you. I was told that you want to help Paintings make this change, safely and considerately. So that is why I am here today.**
Okay, great, well, I am here to help you. Before we can start to make these changes we will have to meet up for some weekly discussions to talk about these potential changes and to make sure you are mentally ready for them. I think it would be helpful if you could bring some examples to work with, so I can get an idea of what you are thinking of. I want you to understand before we start, that this isn’t going to be easy. It is a process and we are finding a whole new visual language for you, us. Not everyone is going to agree with these changes we have made and we will work on some techniques to help you deal with these transitions and changes. We will go slowly and step by step, if things start to go in a direction you aren’t comfortable with, please speak up. I am here to make you, you. So you can come into this world again, as who you are.

That is so great to hear. Honestly, a weight has been lifted. I’m really looking forward to moving forward. When and how do we start?

Well, I would like you to go home and do some thinking. Think about the others you had met and what aspects you enjoyed of them. Think about how you see yourself in the future and some techniques you want to try on to see how you feel. We will have to do some experimenting at first to find out what you feel good in, so please don’t get discouraged, as this is normal. It won’t be easy, but in the long run you are going to be much happier. So let’s met up next week and you bring in some of those examples and thoughts, okay?

Okay, great! I am going to go home and get started on this right away. It feels so good to finally have started this transition. I can’t tell you how much this means to me.

It’s great that you are so enthusiastic, it will only help guide you along in this process. So keep up that energy and I will see you next week.
Next Week (For Inspiration)
Hi, please come on in.

Hi, I came prepared! I did what you told me to do and I brought you some examples.

Great, tell me about them.

Well first I started to think about my form and some materials that I would want to be made out of, so I turned to Franz West and his plaster and papier-mâché pieces, particularly, his piece *Telephon Skulpturen*.

---

1 Franz West, *Telephon Skulpturen*, 1995/96, Sculptures: papier-mâché, plaster paint 55x50x26cm, 60x36x30cm, Table: wood, iron, paint, 73x150x75cm, Collection and Photograph of Annick & Anton Herbert, Gent, Belgique, *Franz West*, by Lynne Cooke., et al. [Fundação de Serralves, 1997] 104.
Okay, great, go on.....

Then I started to think about my family and ancestors and what that means to me, if it is important for me to try to represent them or work within my traditional frame. Also, if there would be a way to be more object-like and/or installational, so I started to think of Angela de la Cruz and her piece *Ashamed*.

---

Then I thought about Lee Bontecou and her transformation into Donald Judd’s coined term “Specific Objects” and her piece **Untitled (1962)**.

---

Lastly, I would also like to look further into anthropomorphism through Yves Klein and his piece *Untitled Sponge Sculpture (SE 248)*.

Now I am not saying that these are the best artists or works, but that they are the best for me at this point in time, for this endeavor.

Yes, great, I think this is a great starting point. So I think that we should just start getting started. I’ll line up some talks and I was also thinking that we could talk to some art critics and such about this type of three-dimensional work with Donald Judd, as you mentioned, and also with Lucy Lippard. Then as we progress and get to know one another more we can talk more about what you want to say and get some thoughts from W.J.T Mitchell, James Elkins and others. Okay?

Okay.

---

The Following Week [Exploration of Materials]
Hi, so let’s recap on the get-together we decided to have in between our scheduled meetings, so that you could be present and get a feeling for some of the materials I was experimenting with. Let’s start off by you telling me of your experiences and thoughts on the materials and if you can see any of them working for you, us. Upon suggestions we started off trying wood, wire mesh, floral foam and sawdust.

I enjoyed the fluidity and forming of the sawdust and also the crunching of the foam really allowed you to create some interesting organic forms, but I don’t like the texture they leave behind and later on when painting on them, the experience is not pleasurable and I just don’t like the end result, so ultimately they are not for me.

Okay, good, we are making progress. Part of the process is to eliminate materials so we can move forward and try others. I think we both know what we want, but this knowledge is not able to be actualized yet and we just need to carve it out. How did you feel about using the wood and wire mesh?

I also don’t think the wood is for me. I like the idea of being made out of something malleable, something that you can directly manipulate by the hand, as with wood you need a chisel. Overall, I think the state of wood is too hard, yes, okay, there are softer woods, but still. I don’t think it is for me.
As for the wire mesh, I think it could be a good bases for something, a sort of skeleton. It is easily manipulated by hand and you can form organic shapes, but in the end it also provides a good infrastructure, giving strength and support.

Yes, these are all good points. So, we should continue forward with the wire mesh. We can move forward and try the wire mesh with some papier-mâché and plaster and for that we can look at and talk to Franz. I will schedule a meeting with him. So, how are you feeling about things thus far?

Well I guess I am just feeling a bit impatient on figuring out who I am, but ultimately I know you are right about this, it is something not to be rushed.
Franz West and Process
I talked to Franz the other day, I thought that you might be interested in some of the things he had to say. He was talking to me about his ways of creating installations with his forms. How he used this idea of the white pedestal within museums and the white cube and made them a part of his pieces, his plinths, and that through this way of presenting his work, he was able to bring multiple forms together, to create one piece.\footnote{Kliege, Melitta, Translated from German by Fiona Elliott, \textit{Abstract Art as Furniture: Autonomous Sculptures by Franz West}, (New York: Gagosian Gallery, 2003), 7-8.} I think this is valuable information to us as I have been thinking about your form. I see you as multiple pieces, in one corner of a room, there are pieces on both sides of the corner, pieces that come from the ceiling and from the floor. A painting that has “exploded” and all the forms create one piece as a whole and are in one part of a room, to mimic the idea of a traditional painting being able to hang in one spot of a wall and perhaps the rope elements within the pieces can tie the pieces together and unite them. How do you feel about this idea? Can you see yourself in this manner?

Yes, I can see myself in this way! I think it would suite me well, as no one is just one thing. I’ve always admired those whom I met and were multi-dimensional, to think I could finally be more like them and more like myself, is truly great. Should we discuss the way of painting?! With multiple forms, I am afraid of becoming too busy.

Yes, you bring up a good point, one I have been thinking of. As my usual style of painting is one of adding and subtracting and the thin layering of paint, to discover the texture previously laid down on the “skin”. I am afraid that this will make things become too busy, as we want things to work cohesively. So as we are on the topic of Franz, I was looking at his ways of painting \textit{Telepohon Skulpturen}, the example you showed me. When looking at this piece, and others, I observed his way of painting three-dimensional forms. He is not trying to find the texture within the materials used to create the piece, but rather he pours the paint on or slops it on with a thick brush stroke, it sits on top of the form and maybe only a few colors are used, layered on top of one another, but in an opaque manner. With multiple forms creating one as a whole, I think we should learn from his example and fine tune things by making some parts more opaque and less textured than others. This will help tone things to a more cohesive level. Also, he is using acrylic and lacquer paint, which has more fluidity than the oil paint we have been using. Lately, I have been feeling extra annoyed with the plasticity of acrylic, but I think we should think about other possible mediums of coloring your form. On the other hand, the use of oil paints does help us tie into tradition, which might make things easier for you. Keeping this aspect alive might help warrant a higher possibility of acceptance from your family. What do you think?
Well I have never had any issues with oil paint itself, but I am not opposed to trying out new ways of pigmentation either. I guess I don’t feel too strongly about it either way, but I do like oil paint. I just don’t want any medium that is too glossy or plastic or artificial feeling. I don’t think I would feel good in that. I like the deep richness that one can achieve with oils and I just don’t want to be too flashy. As for my family, at this point, it is not a concern, I am making this change and I will go full force with it, no in-betweens. It’s time to be me.

I think that is fair, I am not a flashy person myself. Don’t worry we will try to bring you a level of sophistication to your look.

Thank you.

Back onto the topic of cohesion; Lucy Lippard once said; “No matter how large a painting is, the surface can be taken in at a glance, and while the form and color action may be extremely subtle and engender different effects after different viewing times, it can be perceived initially as a unity. A sculpture must hold its own in space and from different angles; color must be so thoroughly controlled that it is both absorbed by and heightens the purpose (formal or psychological) of the sculpture itself.” It is this sense of unity and continuity that we must strive for. I have started your forms and with the inspiration of Franz, the forms have been mostly made out of wire mesh, papier-mâché and plaster. With this method, I have been able to make organic forms and use my hands directly within the materials to form your body; to impregnate you with meaning and to help you emote these qualities. I hope this method will help you have a sense of life and humanness.

Would you like to see some of the forms I created using wire mesh, papier-mâché and plaster?

Oh yes please!

So what do you think? I should tell you first that the low hanging piece, will not be that way, it is only like that because I need to paint it first and get a ladder. Also the one rope hanging to the side will go up to the ceiling and hang down from there. While working on the piece hanging on the left side of the wall, I came to like the idea of the “front” of the piece facing the side, rather than our front. Michael Fried believed that modern art could be understood in terms of showing a lack of desire. He enjoyed Paintings that got what they wanted by looking like they wanted nothing.6

You will be able to seduce, by not seducing.

Yes. I am liking where this is headed. I like this idea of being able to seduce directly and indirectly. As for the figures, it is awfully white now, but I'm guessing this will change once you start to paint, no?

Oh yes, of course. I was thinking that we could talk to Angela next about her use of colors among other things to help us continue our journey. What do you think?

Let's do it!
Angela De La Cruz
(Installation, Object, Anthropomorphism and Color, Oh My!)
Hey Angela, thanks for taking the time to talk to us.

**No problem. How can I help?!**

Well, firstly, Untitled and I were starting to have a discussion on the coloring of its form and as you have used colors in various different ways to explore your concepts, I thought you could help us out with some thoughts on colors and their meanings to you and your work.

Well as far as coloring has gone in my work, at times it had no importance to me and to the meaning of my Painting, but at other times it did. For example, at one point “I felt that by being a monochrome in red, blue or yellow, I had upgraded them into commodity paintings. It was a reference to the “proper” thing, like Minimalism. While dirty colours appeared more earth-bound, more approachable, prone to accident. The dirty ones were of an anthropomorphic nature, quite biographical.” But more specifically speaking, “The surface of Ashamed was almost washed out, with hardly any paint. It was a very rough, almost organic surface. It had to appear dirty and tacky or wet. That kind of surface continued for quite a long time. The work was very physical, and scatological. I started soiling canvases with colours such as brown and red. I was somehow trying to make it anthropomorphic through colour and texture.”

Anthropomorphism, your titles and structures lend to this idea as well. What do you think anthropomorphism lends to your work?

Well, “titling the paintings was a way of justifying their existence. I think they were an attempt to find a position within my work and my environment.” “I am more interested in thinking of these paintings as gestures; in a sense, the painting is calling attention to itself. When I started off with the broken paintings I think I had a great need for the work to be sympathized with and understood. I was breaking what I had learned was a sacred object: the great painting. I converted it into a figurative object through which I could vent myself.”

Interesting, but if we could back track and talk about colors again. Untitled and I have been thinking about its new palette and what it will mean and express to others. Because I am creating Untitled’s form, I will already be emoting through It, therefore, Untitled’s form and body will already be saying something and I think the

---

8 Smith, Trevor. *Angela de la Cruz in Conversation with Trevor Smith*. Angela de la Cruz Trabalho Work, (Culturgest, Edifício-Sede da Caixa Geral de Depósitos, Lisbon/Galleries 1 and 2/ February 1 to April 30, 2006), 184.

9 Smith 186.

10 Smith 185.

11 Smith 186.
color needs to continue to complete this message. I think this message has to do with anthropomorphism, that of humanness, the flesh and emotions that each of us encapsulate. Bill Bullard once said, “Opinion is really the lowest form of human knowledge. It requires no accountability, no understanding. The highest form of knowledge . . . is empathy, for it requires us to suspend our egos and live in another’s world. It requires profound, purpose-larger-than-the-self kind of understanding.”

I agree, “generally I considered the canvas as a parallel of the body. In the early years, I distorted paintings by making holes and ultimately fighting with the square. The notion of the square reflected or represented historical painting to me...What I was looking for was a position in between languages of expression.” And I think anthropomorphism helps brings out a kind of Empathy within Viewers.

So the connection between color and the traditional canvas representing the body did not always have a connection in all of your work, but instead at times how you treated its frame and support, its “skeleton” so to speak, was how you used the language of anthropomorphism. By contorting your “skeletons” you were able to create a three-dimensional object and a character, something to be empathized with. To me this is something of importance because I strive to also be able to create Empathy, but I have approached it more through the emotions of paint, which you have touched upon too, to further complete the idea and gesture of the painting...hmm...For you though, the breaking of the “skeleton” is also very symbolic, you were fighting against the traditional/historical painting, which to you, gives justification and meaning to your work.

Yes.

For me and Untitled, I don’t think the context of the history of Painting directly effects the concept. This idea of history is one that I have been struggling with, with how and if it effects Untitled and I. I think history is something that we learn from and can’t run from, but ultimately, I don’t think the concept of history is needed to justify Untitled. I also wanted to ask you about your ideas on Installation, Untitled here specifically talked to me of your piece entitled Ashamed, which you have already mentioned, but can you tell us of your ideas behind the piece, behind making Installational Painting?

13 Smith, Trevor, Angela de la Cruz in Conversation with Trevor Smith, Angela de la Cruz Trabalho Work, (Culturgest, Edifício-Sede da Caixa Geral de Depósitos, Lisbon/ Galleries 1 and 2/ February 1 to April 30, 2006), 184.
14 Barrett, David, A labourer’s language- Angela de la Cruz Angela de la Cruz Trabalho Work, (Culturgest, Edifício-Sede da Caixa Geral de Depósitos, Lisbon/ Galleries 1 and 2/ February 1 to April 30, 2006), 180.
Ah yes my piece *Ashamed* brings back some memories, “I was asked to participate in a student show with my big paintings, but everyone was fighting for the best position. It was at this moment that I made *Ashamed*. I realized that by installing a painting in the corner, I had created a new space in the gallery, all the other works hung in the middle of the wall at eye level. By hanging *Ashamed* in the corner, it had claimed a space that was all its own. It was a big discovery... I realized that by locating the painting in the corner, there was a new space to explore. The corner challenged the way paintings were to be read. They were suddenly appearing like animated objects. They also had such a literal narrative to them. There was a certain awareness of the viewer. At the end of the day however, it was a gesture in the space. The corner directed the viewer in an alternative way. The act of viewing wasn’t centered so much on looking at the painting as it was considering the action that the painting had on space.”¹⁵

Untitled here will also be placed in a corner, more or less. It won’t literally be stuck in the corner, as *Ashamed* was, but rather the multiple forms will be on either side, connected by rope, so I suppose the actual corner will be further displayed through the positioning of the pieces. I gravitated towards the corner of the room because as the piece is within multiple forms, I think the corner space creates a dynamic for the forms to mingle, that a single flat wall would not be able to achieve. The corner space, creating a 90 degree angle, creates a sense of space and three-dimensionality all on its own. I think Untitled will be happy there.

Okay Angela, I think that wraps it up, I want to thank you for your time and thoughts on these matters.

No problem, glad I could help. My Paintings have also asked me for help before and I needed to figure out what it was they needed and wanted, so I understand what you are going through.

Thanks.

¹⁵ Smith, Trevor, *Angela de la Cruz in Conversation with Trevor Smith, Angela de la Cruz Trabalho. Work* (Culturgest, Edifício-Sede da Caixa Geral de Depósitos, Lisbon/ Galleries 1 and 2/ February 1 to April 30, 2006) 185-86.
Another Week (The First Painting Steps)
So I thought I could update you and show you the first painting steps I have taken.

Great, let’s see!

This was when I wasn’t sure what palette I should go towards, as I wanted to brighten my horizons on colors. However, I do usually lay a ground down with yellow when I paint. Anyway, I knew this wasn’t right, right after I did it, so I painted over it in browns.
The piece on the left side.

And then the piece hanging from the ceiling.
Here are the forms together. I don’t think the rope will stay that bright yellow and they have not been hung properly yet. I have also started the floor piece, but I am still unsure of it and have not started to paint it yet. Thoughts?

Well, I am also unsure of this floor piece. Perhaps it is more geometric than the other pieces, maybe you could use some wire mesh and add more rounded areas, as I feel the other pieces are more rounded and circular. Also, maybe you could cut off some of the bottom half and make the top half more heavy, visually. I would try modifying the piece first before starting anew. As for the other pieces I like the direction they are going and am interested to see what direction this color palette will take. I think I am coming together nicely, but I feel that we have a lot more to do.

Well, maybe so, but we have time and we can do it. I have to believe we can. Okay, let’s take a break from this and clear our heads. In the meantime I will meet up with Lee and Judd to talk about Lee’s work, that which was neither painting nor sculpture.16 Do you want to join me?

Yes.

16 Judd, Donald, Lee Bontecou, 178.
Interview with Lee Bontecou and Donald Judd
(Not Painting, Nor Sculpture)
Hi, glad you could meet us, I was hoping to talk to you two with Untitled here. You both were/ are an integral part of the development of Painting. Lee of course you because of creating this amazing work and you Judd because you supported and wrote about Lee’s work and coined the term “Specific Objects” to describe this kind of work.

Lee, we will use your piece, Untitled [1962], as a base for this discussion, for your series of welded steel and canvas works.

I want to start off the discussion with the fact that these sculptural pieces broke the grounds of two-dimensionality, but still work off of the rectangular frame, hang on a wall and use canvas, albeit the materials used are found materials and the canvas is not the traditional Painter’s canvas. Let’s start with you Judd, what do you make of this?

Judd- Well, “…..a flat and rectangular surface is too handy to give up. Some things can be done only on a flat surface.”17 However, “the main thing wrong with painting is that it is a rectangular plane placed flat against the wall. A rectangle is a shape itself; it is obviously the whole shape; it determines and limits the arrangement of whatever is on or inside of it.”18 And the thing is that “actual space is intrinsically more powerful and specific than paint on a flat surface. Obviously, anything in three dimensions can be any shape, regular or irregular, and can have any relation to the wall, floor, ceiling, room, rooms or exterior or none at all. Any material can be used, as is or painted.”19

So, within Bontecou’s work we can see that she was able to break the rectangular form, within the form, by using three-dimensionality and welding her frame into various forms, extending from the rectangular frame enabling the piece to extend and interact with the room, space and Viewer.

Judd: Yes.

Do you think the use of materials help lend to this new form of work, to “Specific Objects”?

Judd- “The use of three dimensions makes it possible to use all sorts of materials and colors.”20 “The form of a work and its materials are closely related. In earlier work the structure and the imagery were executed in some neutral and

17 Judd, Donald, Specific Objects, 181.
18 Judd 181-182.
19 Judd, Donald, Specific Objects, 186.
20 Judd 187
homogenous material. Since not many things are lumps, there are problems in combining the different surfaces and colors and in relating the parts so as not to weaken the unity.”

Yes, Untitled and I have been discovering that lately, the difficulty of three-dimensional multi-form Painting, to be able to unify and keep that unity within the forms and color.

Anyway, lets hear from you Lee! What about your materials?! Was this of importance to you, the use of materials to create these “Specific Objects”?

Lee- Yes, I liked using these industrious materials that I found second hand; “laundry bags and canvas conveyor belts, metal bolts, gears, war helmets, shrapnel, knapsacks and an abundance of army surplus items, rope, and various other detritus found on Canal Street.”

“Canal Street. Oh, man, it was beautiful. It was terrific. Look at it now. Junk.”

Haha. Yes, that street is crazy.

How did you think of your “Specific Objects”, what entities were they embodying?

Lee- Thanks for asking, “over the years and to the present day, there has been so much written about my work that has nothing to do with me that when I read it, I don’t recognize anything of myself or my work in it.”

“Since my early years until now, the natural world and its visual wonders and horrors- man-made devices with their mind-boggling engineering feats and destructive abominations, elusive human nature and its multiple ramifications from the sublime to unbelievable abhorrences- to me are all one. It is in the spirit of this feeling that the primary influences on my work have occurred. Along with this feeling, walking through the Metropolitan Museum, I would always end up looking at the Greek vases with the wonderful drawings and shapes, and then wander with awe through the African halls. At the Museum of Natural History, the fossils, bones, and panoramas were and are still unbelievable exciting. At the Museum of Modern Art, just to see a single Brancusi sculpture was enough. Those secondary feelings intermingled with the primary emotions that are basic to my work.”

Judd, what do you think of this?! What were your interpretations?

21 Judd, Donald, Specific Objects, 187-188.
24 Bontecou, Lee, Artist Statement, 12.
25 Bontecou 12.
Judd- I thought that “the image cannot be contemplated; it has to be dealt with as an object, at least viewed with puzzlement and wariness, as would be any strange object, and at most seen with terror, as would be a beached mine or a well hidden in the grass. The image extends from something as social as war to something as private as sex, making one an aspect of the other.”

How do you feel about these ideas Lee?

Lee- “The individual is welcome to see and feel in [these works] what he wishes in terms of himself.” I leave my work as Untitled for this reason.

Judd- Yes, “Bontecou’s reliefs are an assertion of herself, of what she feels and knows. Their primitive, oppressive and unmitigated individuality excludes grand interpretations.”

I agree. I also feel this need to leave my work Untitled, as I think titles can inhibit the Viewer on thinking and feeling what the piece can possibly bring and mean to them. It leaves more room for people to come up with their own ideas and not to be influenced, I don’t think there needs to be one absolute for all. How do you feel about this Untitled?! Do you feel okay about having an unnamed name, as Untitled?

Well, it’s funny, as I am now searching for my identity, this idea of Untitled seems well suited, but if I was to think further, when my form has been created, would it still suit me? And I think the answer is yes, because I like the idea of this freedom allowing me to evolve over time, my meaning can change and develop, I can gain new meanings through the times and I think being Untitled gives to others the freedom of the unknown.

On another note Judd, how do you think anthropomorphism is involved within Lee’s work?

Judd- “Three-dimensional work usually doesn’t involve ordinary anthropomorphic imagery. If there is a reference it is ingle and explicit. In any case the chief interests are obvious. Each of Bontecou’s reliefs is an image. The image, all of the parts and the whole shape are coextensive.

26 Judd, Donald, Lee Bontecou, 179.
28 Judd, Donald, Lee Bontecou, 179.
The parts are either part of the hole or part of the mound which forms the hole. The hole and the mound are only two things, which, after all, are the same thing.”

“The image is primarily a single emotive one, which alone wouldn’t resemble the old imagery so much, but to which internal and external references, such as violence and war, have been added. The additions are somewhat pictorial, but the image is essentially new and surprising; an image has never before been the whole work, been so large, been so explicit and aggressive.”

Lee, did Painting have any direct influence on your work?

Lee- I would say that abstract expressionists had a role of inspiration, it opened up an exciting time of exploration, but form was always my interest, rather than Painting.

Alright, well I thank you both for your time on talking about “Specific Objects” with me and Untitled here. It’s one of the important times in history when this type of work was being acknowledged and thought of as an entity on its own, separate from the history of Painting and Sculpture.

---

29 Judd, Donald, *Specific Objects*, 188.
30 Judd 188.
Lucy Lippard [The Non-Movement]
Well Untitled, do I have a surprise for you. I met up with Lucy Lippard and we got to talking.

**About what, what did she have to say?**

Well, similarly to Judd, she talked of “Structural Paintings” which “.....borrows from primary structures. In the present exchange and occasional confusion between painting and sculpture and the structural "third stream" (which includes some shaped canvases), three interacting points seem particularly pertinent: the relationship of painting and sculpture as physical objects, as vehicles for formal or sensuous advance, and as vehicles for color.”

Now that we are on this new endeavor, we are part of a non-movement, we are coming from Painting and not Sculpture, this happens to be usual within this type of work and it lends to a non-sculptural enigma type of work; one that cannot be locked down into a specific definition or movement, as there are more differences than similarities within these types of work, or so Judd also believed; “The new three-dimensional work doesn’t constitute a movement, school or style. The common aspects are too general and too little common to define a movement. The differences are greater than the similarities.” Lippard also seemed to agree with this idea, "...it is a general phenomenon that a good many painters began to “escape” to sculpture, though their lack of sculptural habits and training made the results peculiarly nonsculptural in effect.” The type of work we are doing is more based off of Painting, than Sculpture and with this naivety of working within Sculpture we are able to create something more unique and unrestricted by titles. I have never liked titles anyway.

I also talked to her of our struggles and ponderings on how to paint these forms, as three-dimensionality creates new considerations for us. And as Lippard says, within Painting there are already formalities and guidelines to judge, opposed to Sculpture, where there isn’t and within Painting, no matter how large, we can see the whole piece at once, but with something three-dimensional, we are not able to.

Within these forms and your new identity, we can create reactions and as Clive Bell once said, we can create aesthetic emotions.

---

33 Judd, Donald, Specific Objects. 181.
35 Lippard 125.
Clive believed in subjective aesthetics, he said; “...that any system of aesthetics which pretends to be based on some objective truth is so palpably ridiculous as not to be worth discussing.” That people need only ask themselves “Do I feel this?”, that what matters is the means of creating emotion, these emotions per artwork per person inexplicably vary and from there he tries to distinguish a similarity within the core of artworks to find a base for aesthetics, this was called Significant Form. However, there is also a continuity within these emotions, that although different, it is particular to Art, any kind of Art, and he deemed this emotion to be called aesthetic emotions. So if a Viewer asks themselves “Do I feel this?”, and is able to connect to the Significant Form within you, then you will be able to have others feel this aesthetic emotion, which is what we are striving for.37

Lippard also brought up Bachelard’s terminology, muscular conciousness,38 to talk about our unknown physical reactions to certain forms over others. That maybe it has to do with the artist themselves, and the energy they are putting into the work, or maybe it has to do with the Viewer’s own personal history, allowing them to see and identify with something within the piece. That this could bring up reactions from each side of the spectrum, one of pleasure and the other of repulsion. I think it goes back to Anthropomorphism, the work holds in and emotes these aspects that make us intrinsically human and that which can run the whole spectrum of emotions and therefore can make the Viewer feel a countless number of things.

With that said, I think we should talk to Yves Klein next about his use of Anthropomorphism.

Yves Klein [Anthropomorphism]
So guess whom I bumped into today.

Who?

Yves Klein, that’s who! Pretty lucky, eh?! We had just talked about scheduling a meeting with him, but now we don’t have to; he let me indulge and ask him some questions on the street. I told him that we had been looking at his piece *Untitled Sponge Sculpture SE 248* and its anthropomorphic properties.

Great, what did he have to say?

He said:

“Thanks to the sponges—raw living matter—I was going to be able to make portraits of the observers of my monochromes, who . . . after having voyaged in the blue of my pictures, return totally impregnated in sensibility, as are the sponges. Let me back up, “When working on my pictures in the studio, I sometimes used sponges... Naturally they turned blue very rapidly! One day I noticed how beautiful the blue in the sponge was, and the tool immediately became a raw material. The extraordinary capacity of sponges to absorb everything liquid fascinated me.”

As I mentioned, the sponges were to become portraits of the Viewers through their natural ability to soak in what is around them. The tendencies of a sponge, metaphorically speaking, is also that of breathing, to squeeze and let go of a sponge is to inhale and exhale or of dreaming and waking.

I hope that helps, but I really must go now!

I told him thank you and we parted our own separate ways, but don’t you see *Untitled*?! His pieces were anthropomorphic because they literally soaked up the human traits of those who looked at it. It mimicked the Viewer, it engulfed the Viewer to try to be able to empathize. They could understand one another because they were one another. A piece’s desire, as W.J.T Mitchell once said is that “…Paintings’ desire, in short, is to change places with the beholder, to transfix or paralyze the beholder, turning him or her into an image for the gaze of the picture in what might be called “the Medusa effect.” Therefore the piece is also using us to help fulfill its meaning, identity and desires.

41 Weitemeier 37.
Nietzsche said, “We are like spiders in our own webs, and, whatever we may catch in them, it will only be something that our web is capable of catching.”\textsuperscript{43} Meaning that we can only conceive of what we know and understand, which is ourselves, humans. Likewise, Parker Tyler said, “painting is an anthropomorphic product, being strictly person, unique, and immediate, in the way a razor, for instance, is not.”\textsuperscript{44} Many other scientists and philosophers have found the idea of anthropomorphism problematic, but I tend to side with those that accept that it is just a part of human cognition. I guess if we didn’t believe in this, we wouldn’t be talking right now, now would we Untitled?! 

\textbf{No, we mostly certainly would not! That would be a shame....}

Indeed it would be, speaking of speaking, I want you to do some thoughtful thinking on what you would like to say to the Viewer, to the world, because soon we will be meeting up to discuss about it and start to finish up and polish your form and identity, can you believe it?! 

\textbf{No, I can’t! It’s crazy really. I feel close to understanding myself, but not entirely yet, but hopefully through our discussion soon, these ideas will be able to sort themselves and bring understanding. I think I almost have all the pieces to the puzzle, I just need to arrange them. So yes, let’s talk soon. It will be good to get these thoughts off my chest.}

\textsuperscript{44} Guthrie 144.
Form Follow Up
Hey Untitled, I just wanted to meet up today so that I could update you with the development of your forms, to see how you feel about the changes I have made. I also decided to create a small fifth form, a sort of hub for some of the ropes, I hope you like it. I also made some changes to the floor piece, which we had previously discussed, I think it is looking better and again hopefully you do too.

Here are some pictures, obviously the forms are not done/painted yet. Tell me your thoughts.
Yes, I agree that the floor piece is working better now. I like that you added the “look into” element that some of the other forms have- where there is a hole that you can see “inside the piece”. I think the shape of the form works conceptually more cohesively with the other forms now too. For the fifth form, it looks good, simple, like you said a sort of hub. Where were you thinking of hanging and adding this piece? How will it work with the others?

Good question, I did a little sketch before I made the form and I was thinking that it would go on the left side of the wall so that the rope would stretch on and kind of cross the corner, but now I am unsure, now I am thinking that maybe it would be better diagonally lower and to the right of the piece, staying on the same side of the wall. However, I think ultimately, we just need to try hanging it up and see where it works best. As the form is not structurally done yet and some parts were still wet, I haven’t been able to test it out yet, but let us do that soon.

Okay, great, I guess we will just need to follow up on that, also with how to paint the remaining forms. I also wanted to ask about the blue piece hanging from the ceiling, will it have the same silicone covered rope for it?! How should we address that and account for the various different heights of ceilings and environments? Also, the rope that will extend up from the floor piece, how should that be solved?!

You are asking all very good and important questions, but unfortunately, I don’t have the answers for them, for you yet. I will need to ponder and also ask Teacher’s advice and then I will get back to you on that.
The Easels (What Do Painting’s Want?)
Today I went to a rally on the rights of Painting. The Easels want to keep us two-dimensional, but we have rights! They want to keep us tamed up. That is precisely why people think that Painting is dead! But it is not! Society needs to evolve with us and realize that we aren’t one thing anymore and that it is okay, that it is a good thing, we are able to keep up with technology. Painting has been changing for years now.

Are you okay?

I’m fine, but things got a bit hairy for a little while, the Easels were sent out on us and some of us were captured, I think they were let go later in the day though. Anyway, I had left before all the craziness had started. I don’t get it, we are just looking for equal rights. We are not all one and the same, we all have different identities and ideas, we just want to be seen as ourselves and not as history. Some others also stopped by and helped support us on our journey. Frank Stella tried to reason with them and said; “It’s just that you can’t go back. It’s not a question of destroying anything. If something’s used up, something’s done, something’s over with, what’s the point of getting involved with it?” Don’t think I could have said it better myself.

---

Form Painting Follow Up
Untitled, I wanted to talk to you more about the colors of the forms again...I feel my sensibility has left me. I have been stuck in a similar color palette for awhile and my intuition is waning. However, with that said, I don’t want to over think or put too much thought into the colors/ painting, I think it is best to try to let it flow naturally. There are thoughts of humanness, nature, searching, hiding, changing, connectedness, storytelling, Archaeology, Sociology and Anthropology. I have been thinking lately about what colors are from nature, we think of “earthy” colors in this sense, but I was thinking about a recent mineral exhibition I went to, where you could see these minerals, perhaps simple, subtle ones that were white or gray and then boom! A bright shot of green or some color, a color that I feel instinctively most would think of as an artificial color, but here it is, directly from nature. I think a mixture of these “earthy” and “artificial” colors from nature can still make sense together.

Anyway, I have painted some more of the forms. Here they are...
I am still figuring out how to paint the ropes. I changed things around a bit. The long rope that was going to go down to the floor now goes into the floor piece, connecting the four pieces together. Each form is feeding and nourishing one another, making the separate parts as a whole. The color leaves the body and transforms through the roots and veins maintaining levels of homeostasis like the circulatory system within the human body. The blue piece is on its own, but still connected in its own way, representing the parts unknown or hidden to ourselves, parts that you are still going to be searching for Untitled, even after this journey, because our journey is never complete.
Who Are You?! [Empathy]
Okay Untitled, I think we have gone through all the basics now. We have figured out the tools in which to make you, we have talked to Artists and Art Critics to get some ideas and thoughts on this type of work, but as we recently discussed, I think it’s time for you to try to open up and trust me. I need you to tell me your innermost thoughts, your reasons for being, what you want your identity to truly be saying to the world. Are you ready to do that?

I…….I..think so........

Okay, don’t be scared, we will take things slow. What do you want to put forth towards the world?

I want…I want to be kissed. I want a gesture of affection and beyond. I want the Viewer to be incorporated within me. I want to metaphorically eat and be eaten by the Viewer, to have them live inside me and understand me and I them.  

I want to be an Empath. I want to place take with the Viewers.  
To put myself in their shoes and give them what they need to experience and understand, to feel Empathy. By sharing this knowledge I can achieve a sense of selflessness. For now my life feels of one of selfishness. Here I am spending all this time on myself, trying to understand myself, trying to only identify myself. I have to hope and believe that this inner understanding will help others too. Rifkin says that Selfhood goes together with empathic development. That to increase selfhood, is to increase empathic development, that they are synonymous. That Empathy is based on our frailties and imperfections, the things in which that make us human. Therefore, to give to others I must be an Empathist and to be an Empathist I must know thy self.

Empathy. I don’t have the false reality that I can change the world with my artwork or with your new identity, Untitled, but perhaps we can change our own reality and personal universe, through personal understanding. We would both be lucky if we are able to make one person feel Empathy. But for now, you are my outpouring of emotional abundance, a place for it to be stored, my own personal emotional recycling system. You are my desires and emotions of this moment, these past months of moments. “If the need is pressing and the world is not forthcoming, then vision will dictate how the object of desire can be created.”

---

Elkins believes that we all desire and sometimes that struggle of desire can become so large that we create our own fallacy world. When Viewers look at you, they will see their own personal desires and connect on that personal level. How does that coincide with Empathy? “Looking immediately activates desire, possession, violence, displeasure, pain, force, ambition, power, obligation, gratitude, longing...there seems to be no end to what seeing is.....”\textsuperscript{51} When we look at you and if we immediately are activated by these emotions, are these emotions Empathetic?! What is your definition of Empathy, Untitled?

I have been thinking of this idea, my definition of Empathy, and wondering how to put it into words. Kenneth B. Clark defines Empathy as “the capacity of an individual to feel the needs, the aspirations, the frustrations, the joy, the sorrows, the anxieties, the hurt, indeed, the hunger of others as if they were his own”\textsuperscript{52}

I feel that to have Empathy for another, you would need to place take and feel how you felt or would feel in that situation from possibly your own past experiences. This bringing a sense of understanding for what that person is going through and an understanding of how you would feel in that situation and what you would want out of it. The emotions, our emotions, generally speaking, are universal. So if looking immediately activates desire and a whole list of other possible emotions than I think it is safe to say that it can activate Empathy, that these emotions can be Empathetic. Arnheim said; “Its presence is surely indispensable if one wishes to describe the aesthetic experience, for which the concept of empathy was originally coined.”\textsuperscript{53} So it’s synonymous, if we want to talk about our experience with Art that we talk about Empathy.

I will reference Elkins again, if you don’t mind me doing so.

\textbf{Not at all.}

“There is no such thing as a pure self, or a pure object apart from that self.” \textsuperscript{54} Elkins talks about the difficulty of being able to state the line between the Object and the Observer. Through our everyday language we may state that we are ‘lost’ in a Painting or other, making that line blurred.\textsuperscript{55} I think we have established that your desire is to blur these lines with the Viewer, but what about when it comes down to the Object and the Artist? Is our relationship blurred and one of symbiosis?

\textsuperscript{53} Arnheim 54.
\textsuperscript{55} Elkins 44.
Or am I simply creating my desires that I am not able to receive from the world? Am I truly listening to your desires as I create you? If so, then if my or your desires of this moment were different then your identity could have turned out very different. That is if the work is created solely by desire, but is it? I think that I tried hard to listen to you. You came to me to create a new identity and I tried to listen to how you wanted to be formed, what color(s) you wanted to be. Sometimes this dialogue was hard to hear; the message couldn’t come through clearly and I had to go through trial and error. Perhaps these were the moments of uncertainty that you had yourself. Your voice was my intuition telling me where to go next, to make you, you.

Yes, it is true. At times I was timid and unsure of what to tell you.

Like the Viewer and the Object, I believe this dynamic was symbiotic, I listened to you to hear where to go next, but you also learned and listened to me. Annie Murphy Paul, a science writer, once said: "Much of what a pregnant woman encounters in her daily life – the air she breathes...even the emotions she feels – are shared in some fashion with her fetus...The fetus incorporates these offerings into its own body, makes them part of its flesh and blood." For us I think it is similar, like a fetus in a womb, you have been instinctively absorbing and learning through me and my hands, knowing what I feel, you use this to survive in the world. You might be here long after I am gone and you will need this knowledge to survive on your own.

Yes, I think you are right, I learn from you, I take from you and then I move on from you, as you do. I, a mere step in your developmental process of your personal language, and you, the hands and soothsayer to create my new identity. Our relationship is symbiotic in one capacity, until it changes to the other. First you create me and then you observe me and I use what I have learned to make myself attractive to the world, to be noticed. I use you, your gaze, to help complete me. Your desires and vulnerabilities, your lackings, can be healed for a brief moment, until we part. We are one, for a brief moment. I see what you need and reflect it back unto you. I create a new identity each moment, each new glare and Viewer to seduce, to make you feel connected and not so alone in this world. You are not a stranger here. I use my roots to reach out and grab you, they pump nourishment throughout me and unto you, if you allow me to. I am a romantic and I hope to consume and be consumed a countless number of times. I don’t get full and now I can feel that I am nearly complete and ready to eat.

---


All Things Come to an End
So here we are Untitled, at the end of our journey. I can hardly believe it, but here we are. And you Untitled, how do you feel?

I feel, I feel...ready.

We have gone through a lot together, but now it is time for you to go out onto the world on your own and show off your new identity, well you won’t be completely alone. We both have figured out some things about ourselves, I, a better understanding of my process, what is important to me within the use of the materials and also how to work within and about the genre of three-dimensional Installational Painting. Not to say I have it all figured out now. And you, Untitled, tell me what you have learned.

A way of life. What I feel, what I want to say and how I can use my body to represent that.

I will be completely honest with you Untitled. I haven’t fully decided yet how I feel about your new identity. I hope you can feel more confident about things than I, but I have to thank you. This has been an important step for me to move forward and I can’t see myself ever going back to the more traditional two-dimensional ways of Painting, not that I don’t enjoy looking at them, it just isn’t for me and my personal process. It is a step I have been wanting to do for a long time now and with your help, I was able to achieve this process. I hope you feel good about what we have accomplished here and that you are happy with your new identity.

I am happy with my new identity, thank you. If you ever want to work together again, perhaps I will feel the need for a change again, I will be sure to contact you. But Niina, you are really leaving me in anticipation!! Can you hold up a mirror so I can see myself?!

Oh goodness yes, sorry about that Untitled. Are you sure that you are ready?

I am!

Here you are....

Why I’m...I’m lovely! Thank you! I feel much more comfortable now.

The nice thing about you is that you will always change a bit, depending on the space you will be in. Soon we will be moving again and you will be seen by our peers, so rest up, we still have a long road ahead of us....
Where Did You Get That?! [Bibliography]


Barret, David, Miguel Wandschneider, Angela de la Cruz: Trabalho Work, Lisbon: Culturgest, Edifício-Sede da Caixa Geral de Depósitos, 2006. Published in conjunction with the exhibition “Angela de la Cruz: Trabalho Work” shown at Culturgest Galleries 1 and 2, Lisbon, Portugal 1 February to 30 April 2006.


